

External Evaluation Report

University “KADRI ZEKA”

Final Version

June 5, 2016

- Pre-School	BA 240 ECTS
- Primary School	BA 240 ECTS
- Management	BA 180 ECTS
- Computer Sciences	BSc 180 ECTS

Contents

1. Introduction	3
1.1. Context	3
1.2. Experts.....	3
1.3 Coordinators of KAA.....	3
1.4. Abbreviations used	3
1.5. Procedure and evidence collection	4
1.5.1. Self-Evaluation Report	4
1.5.2. On-site visit.....	4
2. Study Programmes	6
2.1 Pre-school (BA 240 ECTS).....	6
2.1.1 Curriculum and Teaching.....	6
2.1.2 Research and Internationalization.....	7
2.1.3 Staff	7
2.1.4 Recommendations	8
2.2 Primary School (BA 240 ECTS).....	10
2.1.1 Curriculum and Teaching.....	10
2.1.2 Research and Internationalization.....	11
2.1.3 Staff	11
2.1.4 Recommendations	12
2.3 Management (BA 180 ECTS)	14
2.3.1 Curriculum and Teaching.....	14
2.3.2 Research and Internationalization.....	16
2.3.3 Staff	17
2.3.4 Recommendations	18
2.4 Computer Sciences (BSc 180 ECTS).....	20
2.4.1 Curriculum and Teaching.....	20
2.4.2 Research and Internationalization.....	21
2.4.3 Staff	21
2.4.4 Recommendations	22

1. Introduction

(DI Dr. Bratengeyer)

1.1. Context

The present document is the final report about the external evaluation of four study programmes at the University “KADRI ZEKA”, Gjilan (UKZ). The report is the result of the collegial work of an international team of three experts appointed by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA). The evaluation report bases on the self-evaluation report of UKZ (SER 2016) with special regard to the four study programmes and the visit of the expert group at the university on May 10th, 2016.

1.2. Experts

The team consisted of the following experts:

DI Dr. Erwin Bratengeyer / *Danube University Krems (AT)*

Prof. Dr. Josep Maria Duart / *Open University of Catalonia (ES)*

Prof. Dr. Kristiina Tonnisson/ *Tartu University (EE)*

1.3 Coordinators of KAA

Mr. Fisnik Gashi

Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring – KAA

1.4. Abbreviations used

The following abbreviations are used in the present document:

ET	Expert team
KAA	Kosovo Accreditation Agency
OSV	On-site visit
SER	Self-Evaluation Report
UKZ	University “KADRI ZEKA” Gjilan
FED	Faculty of Education
FEC	Faculty of Economics
FCS	Faculty of Computer Science

1.5. Procedure and evidence collection

1.5.1. Self-Evaluation Report

The Self-Evaluation Report (SER) is the central document for the institutional accreditation. The very extensive report gives a very good overview about study programmes, research activities and staff.

1.5.2. On-site visit

On May 10, 2016 the three experts gathered in the morning for a preliminary working breakfast together with a member of KAA. They talked about their first impressions of the SER and the programme for the OSV.

On May 10th, the ET spent one day at the UKZ, accompanied by KAA-Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring Mr. Fisnik Gashi. The OSV took place as planned. The scheduled OSV started in the morning with a meeting with the management of the university.

Prof. Asoc. Dr. Bajram Kosumi, Rector
Prof. Ass. Dr. Shpresë Qamili, Prorectore
Prof. Ass. Dr. Dukagjin Leka, Prorector
Prof. Asoc. Dr. Januz Dervodeli, Dean
Prof. Ass. Dr. Sadik Haxhiu, Dean
Prof. Ass. Dr. Gëzim Tosuni, Dean
Prof. Asoc. Dr. Xhevdet Thaqi, Dean
Mr. sc. Vaxhid Sadriu, Secretary

Then the expert team split up in three groups for a meeting with responsible persons for the study programmes (curriculum, teaching, research, recommendations).

Pre-school and Primary (Faculty of Education)

Prof.Asoc.Dr. Xhevdet Thaqi
Prof.Ass.Dr. Nevrije Ismajli
Prof.Asoc.Dr. Bajram Kosumi
Prof.Asoc.Dr. Januz Dervodeli
Prof.Ass.Dr. Merxhan Avdyli
Prof.Ass.Dr. Shpresë Qamili

Management (Faculty of Economics)

Prof.Ass.Dr. Gëzim Tosuni
Prof.Ass.Dr. Naim Mustafa
Prof.Ass.Dr. Musa Ajeti
Mr,Sc Arben Sahiti

Computer Sciences (Faculty of Computer Sciences)

Prof.Ass.Dr. Basri Ahmedi

Prof.Ass.Dr. Ekrem Halimi
Prof.Ass.Dr. Ragmi Mustafa
Ligjerues Nysret Demaku

A visit to facilities followed. After a working lunch the ET had two brief interview sessions with academic staff and students.

Academic staff:

Prof.Asoc.Dr. Fatbi Osmani
Asistente Teuta Agaj
Prof.Ass.Dr. Nerxhivane Krasniqi
Bashkim Dalipi
Asistent Mensur Neziri
Prof.Ass.Dr. Lutfi Zharku
Prof.Ass.Dr. Arben Mustafa
Prof.Ass.Dr. Artan Dërmaku
Ligjëruese Lindita Nebiu

Students:

Edona Byqmeti
Marigona Shaqiri
Albesa Kryeziu
Blerina Ajvazi
Mehmet Zylfiu
Fjolla Hajdari
Erëza Demi
Rinor Zenuni

The visit ended with short consultations of ET and KAA and then a final meeting with the management of the institution.

The ET would like to express its gratefulness to UKZ for the very professional organization of the visit.

In addition, the experts warmly thank KAA for their outstanding support and cooperation before, during and after the visit.

2. Study Programmes

The following chapters are focused on four study programmes submitted for re-accreditation:

- Pre-school	BA 240 ECTS
- Primary School	BA 240 ECTS
- Management	BA 180 ECTS
- Computer Sciences	BSc 180 ECTS

2.1 Pre-school (BA 240 ECTS)

(Prof. Dr. Duart)

The Faculty of Education created the Bachelor's Degree in Pre-school Education as a four-year programme (240 ECTS credits). This degree was designed to provide students with training that would allow them to acquire knowledge in basic subjects like Maths and Language as well as Nature, Society, Art, etc., using an interdisciplinary approach and increasingly introducing the use of information technology. The Faculty of Education promotes a training model based on three pillars: knowledge content acquisition, active and inclusive training methodology, and pedagogical practices at school.

As the SER mentions on page 24, the main expected learning outcomes of the Bachelor's Degree in Pre-school Education are in summary: to prepare practically and theoretically pre-school teachers; to implement different options for studying education issues with pre-school students; to enable work in interdisciplinary and inclusive education; to promote didactics specific to pre-school education; and to use correctly information technologies in this educational period. These are very ambitious expected learning outcome, and the faculty members of the FoE could achieve them if their professional work is based on academic knowledge and pedagogical expertise, and supported by staff enthusiasm and teamwork.

2.1.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The Faculty of Education has been implementing the main prior recommendations (2014) in terms of the curriculum design of the Bachelor's Degree in Pre-school Education. The FoE made changes related to Maths and English course content in order to adapt them to the context of pre-school education.

The curriculum of this bachelor's degree is complete and ambitious. In regard to knowledge content, it covers all the subjects expected and also provides the students with a good balance of theory and practice.

Teaching practices are very important in this academic programme. The teaching practices of the professors of the FoE should serve both as an example for this student programme

and also as a working model that integrates knowledge and practice and that allows work to be done in an inclusive and interdisciplinary way. The teaching creativity perspective and the use of games and interdisciplinary projects in teaching should also be one of the main challenges adopted by the FoE academic staff.

2.1.2 Research and Internationalization

The Self-Evaluation Report remarks that there is a research plan under evaluation for the Pre-School Education bachelor's degree programme, based on the definition of two research projects: one focused on the analysis of school teachers', principals' and parents' opinion in relation to if it is necessary to have one or more teachers in grades 1-5 of primary school, and the second one analysing those same profiles in regard to focussing on the identification of children with special needs in Anamorava. We agree with promoting and facilitating these research projects based on information acquisition for the further analysis of the context of proximity and community, in order to analyse the main educational needs and define future educational needs.

Internationalisation is another of the main issues that the FoE needs to develop in order to offer an open perspective to Pre-school Education students. There are, nowadays, many interesting new approaches and new experiences in Europe and in other areas of the world to be analysed and discussed by the academic staff and Pre-school Education students. We can learn a lot from these new educational approaches and experiences. The FoE should explore the best way to validate if some of these new experiences could be suitable for the Kosovo, or Gjilan, context.

The FoE is currently involved in two European projects (Erasmus Mundus and Erasmus +) and is working with two more projects. We see this as very positive and this could be a great opportunity for the members who are participating or will participate in these projects to receive important inputs with which to improve their practices and the programme curriculum.

2.1.3 Staff

According to the information provided during the site visit and in the SER, there are 9 full-time and 14 part-time professors at the FoE. The 14 part-time professors include 3 teaching assistant professors. The entire academic staff works on two bachelor's degree programmes: Pre-school Education and Primary School Education. During the site visit, the rector mentioned some possible academic staff incorporations approved by the MEST for the following academic year.

Increasing the number of professors is one of the important challenges facing the FoE. The number of students is increasing and in some cases the course will have to be split into two groups to facilitate better interaction and better interactive teaching practices. Reducing the number of the students would be another way to ensure a better academic staff-student ratio and allow better interaction and facilitate better academic achievement.

2.1.4 Recommendations

Experts' common recommendations for the Pre-school Education and Primary School Education bachelor's degree programmes:

- 1. We recommend improving the interdisciplinary approach of the curriculum or the cross-curriculum activities. The bachelor's degree curriculum is focused on disciplinary subjects, based on knowledge content. In the case of the Pre-school Education bachelor's degree in particular, an interdisciplinary approach based on innovative methodologies would offer future teachers a better global vision of the real context of pre-school education and a better way to understand the pupils' educational needs.*
- 2. We recommend reviewing the methodological subjects and using the word "didactics" instead of "methodology" or "teaching methodology" in the course name. This is not only a proposal to change the subject name. The idea is to work with the students on "didactics", not "methodologies", which means focusing on teaching students the best way to teach each subject or discipline, not teaching them the specific methodologies for each discipline.*
- 3. We recommend organizing teaching work teams at the FoE as interdisciplinary teacher training groups where academic faculty share teaching experiences, improve teaching methodologies and analyse the students' educational needs as a team. These teaching work teams should be a foundation for new academic proposals, new methodologies and didactics implementation, as well as new research proposals.*
- 4. We recommend promoting internationalisation and the FoE's participation in international projects, but we also recommend promoting internationalisation by introducing an international vision of and approach to the bachelor's degree curriculum. Internationalization should be one of the main cross-skills on the bachelor's degree curriculum.*
- 5. We recommend defining a process to select the school mentors. It is also necessary to design a mentor training course and an assessment process for their activity according to the main goals of the bachelor's degree programme.*
- 6. We recommend developing an ICT-usage strategy for academic purposes, in particular to create an ICT-based network that helps and improves relations and knowledge sharing among academic staff, students, mentors and schools.*
- 7. We recommend developing a quality assurance process specific to each programme that provides significant information about the evolution of the programme, student and teacher satisfaction, and learning outcome achievement. This information should be used for the continuous improvement of the bachelor's degree programme.*

Experts' specific recommendations for the Pre-school Education bachelor's degree programme:

- 8. We recommend exploring new didactic approaches suited to pre-school pupils needs in order to define an innovative way of working with kids in that stage of learning. For instance, using games, art, bodily expression, emotions, arts and crafts, etc., as a learning activity that compliments the knowledge-based ones. That could be the way to define a new curriculum for Pre-school Education based on real pupils' needs.*

Conclusion: To provide accreditation for a 3-year period.

Barcelona, 5th of June 2016

2.2 Primary School (BA 240 ECTS)

(Prof. Dr. Duart)

The Bachelor's Degree in Primary School Education was designed as a four-year programme (240 ECTS credits). The three pillars that the Faculty of Education promotes as its training model are very important to primary school teacher training. These three pillars are: knowledge content acquisition, an active and inclusive training methodology, and pedagogical practices at school. The EP recommends working on these three pillars as a whole, not separately, because we believe that the only way to approach the content and the methodology and put it all into practice is by using a holistic approach, not by working on these issues one by one.

As the SER mentions on page 80, the main expected learning outcomes of the bachelor's degree are: students' ability to teach based on scientific knowledge, artistic creation, pedagogical experience and innovative methodologies, promoting inclusive education. Another expected outcome could be comprehension of the curriculum and the promotion of significant curriculum changes. These are very ambitious expected learning outcomes, and the faculty members of the FoE could achieve them if their professional work is based on academic knowledge and pedagogical expertise and supported by staff enthusiasm and teamwork.

The Faculty of Education currently has two bachelor's degree programmes (Pre-school Education and Primary School Education) and both are in the re-accreditation process. The FoE and the academic staff are the same for both programmes. This is the reason why we are using the same approach and at times similar comments in the analysis of the curriculum and teaching; research and internationalisation; and the academic staff. Of course, we will provide different recommendations for each programme.

2.1.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The Faculty of Education has been implementing the main prior recommendations (2014) in terms of the curriculum design of the Bachelor's Degree in Primary School Education. The curriculum is now well-structured and suitable for training Kosovan primary school teachers. There are some areas on the curriculum that are in need of improvement, and we will discuss that in our recommendations. The EP has summarised these areas under two main issues: a) improving the cross-disciplinary rather than the subject- or discipline-based curriculum; and b) focussing the curriculum more on innovative didactics in teaching methodologies than basic subject knowledge.

Teaching practices are very important in this academic programme. The teaching practices of the professors of the FoE should serve both as an example for this student programme and also as a working model that integrates knowledge and practice and that allows work to be done in an inclusive and interdisciplinary way. The teaching creativity perspective and the use of games and interdisciplinary projects in teaching should also be one of the main challenges facing the FoE academic staff.

In particular, on the Primary School Education bachelor's degree programme, the FoE has to consider the possibility of adapting continuously the programme curriculum to the MEST guidelines for the new competence-based national school curriculum.

2.1.2 Research and Internationalization

The Self-Evaluation Report remarks that the same research plan for the Pre-school Education bachelor's degree programme is under evaluation for the Primary School Education programme, based on the definition of two research projects: one focused on the analysis of school teachers', principals' and parents' opinion in relation to if it is necessary to have one or more teachers in grades 1-5 of primary school, and the second one analysing those same profiles in regard to focussing on the identification of children with special needs in Anamorava. We agree with promoting and facilitating these research projects based on information acquisition for the further analysis of the context of proximity and community, in order to analyse the main educational needs and define future educational needs.

Internationalisation is another of the main issues that the FoE needs to develop in order to offer an open perspective to Primary School Education students. There are, nowadays, many interesting new approaches and new experiences in Europe and in other areas of the world to be analysed and discussed by the academic staff and Primary School Education students. We can learn a lot from these new educational approaches and experiences. The FoE should explore the best way to validate if some of these new experiences could be suitable for the Kosovo, or Gjilan, context.

The FoE is currently involved in two European projects (Erasmus Mundus and Erasmus +) and is working with two more projects. We see this as very positive and this could be a great opportunity for the members who are participating or will participate in these projects to receive important inputs with which to improve their practices and the programme curriculum.

In particular, in the case of the Primary School Education programme, the EP considers that it could be good to focus the new research project proposals on two issues: a) analysis of the impact of the new didactics or teaching methodologies on the learning achievement of the students, and b) mechanisms to promote the participation of parents and society in school dynamics. These two topics should provide the FoE and its academic staff with interesting information in order to improve programme curricula and their relation with the social context.

2.1.3 Staff

According to the information provided during the site visit and in the SER, there are 9 full-time and 14 part-time professors at the FoE. The 14 part-time professors include 3 teaching assistant professors. The entire academic staff works on two bachelor's degree programmes: Pre-school Education and Primary School Education. During the site visit, the

rector mentioned some possible academic staff incorporations approved by the MEST for the following academic year.

Increasing the number of professors is one of the important challenges facing the FoE. The number of students is increasing and in some cases the course will have to be split into two groups to facilitate better interaction and better interactive teaching practices. Reducing the number of the students would be another way to ensure a better academic staff-student ratio and allow better interaction and facilitate better academic achievement.

In particular, on the Primary School Education bachelor's degree programme, the FoE has to consider the possibility of having some assistants, not necessarily academic staff, in order to help the academic staff in organizing and monitoring the practices at school. That can reduce the time that academic staff work on managerial issues, freeing them up to work with the mentors at the schools and with the students.

2.1.4 Recommendations

Experts' common recommendations for the Pre-school Education and Primary School Education bachelor's degree programmes:

- 1. We recommend improving the interdisciplinary approach of the curriculum or the cross-curriculum activities. The bachelor's degree curriculum is focused on disciplinary subjects, based on knowledge content. In the case of the Pre-school Education bachelor's degree in particular, an interdisciplinary approach based on innovative methodologies would offer future teachers a better global vision of the real context of pre-school education and a better way to understand the pupils' educational needs.*
- 2. We recommend reviewing the methodological subjects and using the word "didactics" instead of "methodology" or "teaching methodology" in the course name. This is not only a proposal to change the subject name. The idea is to work with the students on "didactics", not "methodologies", which means focusing on teaching students the best way to teach each subject or discipline, not teaching them the specific methodologies for each discipline.*
- 3. We recommend organizing teaching work teams at the FoE as interdisciplinary teacher training groups where academic faculty share teaching experiences, improve teaching methodologies and analyse the students' educational needs as a team. These teaching work teams should be a foundation for new academic proposals, new methodologies and didactics implementation, as well as new research proposals.*
- 4. We recommend promoting internationalisation and the FoE's participation in international projects, but we also recommend promoting internationalisation by introducing an international vision of and approach to the bachelor's degree*

curriculum. Internationalization should be one of the main cross-skills on the bachelor's degree curriculum.

- 5. We recommend defining a process to select the school mentors. It is also necessary to design a mentor training course and an assessment process for their activity according to the main goals of the bachelor's degree programme.*
- 6. We recommend developing an ICT-usage strategy for academic purposes, in particular to create an ICT-based network that helps and improves relations and knowledge sharing among academic staff, students, mentors and schools.*
- 7. We recommend developing a quality assurance process specific for each programme that provides significant information about the evolution of the programme, student and teacher satisfactions, and learning outcome achievement. This information should be used for the continuous improvement of the bachelor's degree programme.*

Experts' specific recommendations for the Primary School Education bachelor's degree programme:

- 1. We recommend developing training courses on innovative teaching practices targeted at academic staff members. We also recommend developing training courses on designing courses based on skills and on learning outcomes and skills assessment.*
- 2. We recommend exploring the potential of ICT in education as a tool for the creation of new courses or teaching and learning resources developed by bachelor's degree students in the Albanian language. Those resources, developed as open educational resources, should be used by school teachers and school students for specific teaching and learning purposes.*

Conclusion: To provide accreditation for a 3-year period.

Barcelona, 5th of June 2016

2.3 Management (BA 180 ECTS)

(Prof. Dr. Tonnisson)

The BSc programme in Management corresponds to the institution's mission and the principles of operation. The aim of the programme is to equip the graduates with applicable knowledge and skills for being effective managers in various organizations in the market economy heavily needed in nowadays Kosovo. BSc programme under evaluation is aiming to provide contemporary theoretical and practical knowledge in the field of Management that is needed both in private or public sector organizations, both within Kosovo and abroad.

2.3.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The BSc programme in Management is considered in current curricula development as one of the main programmes in the Faculty of Economics. The curriculum tries to cover both classical management part as well as specific knowledge (informatics, business rights, banking etc.). The purpose of the programme is quite clear - to train the professionals who will be working as executive administrators and/or managers in various sectors. Although officially the programme is training the professionals both for public and private sector, currently the programme has much stronger foundation in general business management than in public management.

This programme is hoped to provide solutions to different challenges in different sectors in Kosovo covering the general knowledge of management. Curriculum is build up in a way to be able to respond to various short-term and long-term management challenges within an organization. The development of the programme has been rather efficient, since all the courses offered during the first two semesters are being offered by the faculty anyway.

The programme consists of 120 ECTS credits and its structure meets the legal requirements. The study subjects are spread appropriately on both the full time and part time programmes. Each semester the students should obtain 30 ECTS. In first semester they do not have any options to choose among the courses, but starting from the second semester the students can choose 1-2 elective per semester. Most courses would give 6 ECTS, but some of them would give also 8, 5 or 4 ECTS. The diploma thesis itself gives 10 ECTS.

Currently there is no special methodology course. The reviewer suggests putting more emphasis on methodological issues in separate course or within existing courses as this is usually the biggest problem/ lacking skills in most programmes. Currently the students of the programme do not have enough methodological support. Since the management of the programme is considering the current programme more as "a soft management programme", the future changes within curriculum could be based on this approach. Also the student pointed out the desire to have more communication, negotiation, psychology, etc. courses. The current titles of the courses (also English translation of the titles) might be

reconsidered, since looking at them within one curriculum many of them do not make sense as much as they could (e.g. the curriculum has the courses “Informatics I” as well as “Informatics in business”, separate course on “Management” as well as various management fields separately e.g. “HRM, strategic management, SME management, etc.” a course on “Business rights” and a course on “International business rights”, a course on “Project management” and a separate course on “IT and project planning”). Another suggestion is to include required internship into the programme. Even if the programme puts already quite a lot emphasis on connecting the programme with social partners, a formal internship system as a separate course or within existing courses could offer an additional value.

Looking at the current course syllabi, course descriptions and the reading materials there is no clear link between the amount of reading materials/ home assignments/work hours and the credits given (even if in the documents it is clearly stated how much work each credit would cover, the course syllabi do not reflect it). Thus it is not clear why some courses will give more credits than others. This aspect should be brought out in a curriculum design as well as in SER in a much more clear way. Also the courses/course syllabi are rather standardized currently. Based on SER very many courses (more than 70%) have exactly same evaluation methods (not just methods, but also the same percentage): the final grade is based on mid-term exams, attendance and final exam. It is not advised to have so standardized approach to the courses. During the meeting with the academic staff it became clear that in reality the syllabi vary much more and the teachers are applying different assessment methods. It is advised that also SER would reflect more the reality in teaching.

Generally classes have been well received and students appreciate the experience teachers bring into the classroom. Even if the programme is not based on an overarching didactic concept (there was not any concrete concept that the programme would follow, mostly it was mentioned the keywords “practice oriented”, “student centered”, “based on the needs of the market” etc.), the teachers are aware of different possible approaches and teaching methods. Different teachers are communicating to each other and adopting/ testing different concepts offering to the programme additional value – the students will get to know various competing approaches to teaching and learning. According to the interviews with the academic staff the teachers are actively using real life projects and case studies. Students are required to complete various home assignments/coursework and to present results to others, to discuss and to defend their arguments.

As far as the sources of literature for students are concerned, the lists of compulsory reading could be revised in most of the course descriptions. Currently in syllabi there are listed mostly textbooks as reading materials. It is suggested to consider also scientific articles from journals as required (or at least suggested) reading materials since the new

and relevant/ up to date knowledge is often delivered more/ faster throughout the articles than within the books.

The overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum is rather comprehensible and transparent. It is suggested to pay more attention to possible options to include more international expertise/ lecturers to the curriculum. Also more effort is needed while working out the intended learning outcomes both for the programme as well as for the courses. The current LOs of the programme are: “the students will also gain a high level of knowledge on management, finance, macroeconomic analysis, microeconomics, writing and communication skills, human resource management, management of database, international business and other fields, enabling them to complete their managing skills”. This is more the list of the topics to be covered than LOs. It is suggested to have special training for the staff about what is the meaning of LOs and how to write them.

The admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards nicely. Still, based on the feedback from the teachers and management it is advised to decrease the number of accepted students in order to increase the quality of teaching/ learning and also improve the ratio among teachers and students. Also huge grey area is existing due to the system that the students can have their students’ status for too long time (twice more than their nominal time of studies, altogether 6 years) and they can basically take unlimited times exams. It is strongly advised to consider changing the system both concerning maximum study length as well as putting limits to maximum times a person can take exams. In general center for student services is at the disposal of students throughout the studying period. Required accompanying services/systems are in place in order to help the students in whatever questions. As a positive example of students’ management, the faculty has a certain additional training project/scheme currently running for the top/most talented students of the faculty.

Summarizing the analysis about the curriculum and teaching, it is possible to conclude that, the scope and content of the programme are generally sufficient and appropriate to ensure the achievement in the areas of the learning outcomes. Programme’s quality, range and aims are appropriate for an academic degree BSc in Management.

2.3.2 Research and Internationalization

The teaching staff has a rather long list of publications. There are listed altogether 57 publications for the last 5 years as the scientific output of the Faculty of Economics. Since most of the teaching staff is teaching for various programmes, it is hard to say how many of these publications are directly connected to the current programme. Based on the names listed in various tables it is fair to say that around 50% of the total number of the publications could be connected to the programme. Taking into account that there are ca 10 FT teaching staff, the averagely each of them is publishing ca 2,5 articles per 5 years. This number is rather low for Western standards, but could be considered as positive for such a young university in Kosovo. Even if the number of publications/presentations as

such might be considered as acceptable or high based on argumentation before, the research coming out of the teaching staff is not resulting in sufficient high level peer-reviewed international academic publications (e.g. most of the publications are conference proceedings, publications in various schools' journals, papers presented at the seminars, etc.). It would be important to encourage staff to increase their capabilities by publishing research work in peer reviewed international academic journals.

The school is making the first steps towards internationalization while looking for possible educational partners abroad, for possible common projects and exchange programmes. Also the series of "international guest speakers" could be considered as one example towards this direction. Still, currently the internationalization is mostly happening based on the personal contacts the staff is bringing to the school. The participation and access on international research projects is limited and it would be very much encouraged to initiate such applications/ common research projects more actively. Time should be allocated for preparing such applications and building international connections. Also international recruitment could be considered in the future.

For the future it is recommended to use of more guest speakers /international expertise on the programme (within regular courses, not just as separate events), so this is an initiative to be encouraged. It is also suggested that some of the optional courses will be delivered in English in the future. The evaluator encourages the school to look also for possibilities for international internships, exchange programmes and international applied research projects where students could take part and gain valuable practical experience. One certain idea to consider in the future is to have English language as an entrance exam

2.3.3 Staff

Based on the meetings with various groups it became clear that UKZ (especially the Faculty of Economics) is heavily lacking staff. Even if the general management of UKX pointed proudly out the motivation of the staff to work often over hours without any pay, this system is not for sure sustainable. To have some people working over hours sometimes can be a sign of high motivation and good HRM system, but to have a constant system like this in place is more a sign of critical personnel policy and lack of finances.

In general the teaching staff in the field is competent and motivated. All the courses are led/ supervised by PhDs or professors. Their qualifications are appropriate to the positions they hold within the institution. Based on the SER and meeting with the administration there are 11 full time teachers and 13-15 part time teachers connected to the programme. Considering the number of the students (in total 587 students in the programme), the ratio between academic staff and students could be still considered reasonable. Then again – since most of the courses are carried out by permanent staff, the number of the teachers is still very critical.

Maybe because of this situation there was not clear common understanding among the staff what courses could be considered as the core courses of the curriculum or how could be the focus of the curriculum described or what could be the USP of the programme that no other similar management programmes would have. Current human resource situation around this BSc curriculum does not give enough evidence of being implemented with enough academicians concentrating to build up a new fully competitive BSc curriculum.

Currently the programme's strongest point is its leader – Ass.Prof Gezim Tosunu and his closest team. It is suggested to rely more on his and his colleagues' international experience to move on with programme development. They have the vision, motivation, backbone and also the skills to move forward with developing the programme. At the same time Ass. Prof. Tosunu is currently also the Dean of Economics Faculty in UKZ. The fact, that he does not have assistant neither on faculty level or on programme level shows clearly the lack of sustainable system. Therefore it is strongly suggested that in order to increase the quality of the programme, the developers of the programmes should have enough time to plan, implement and evaluate the developments. Current system does not offer enough resources for that.

Based on various meetings it is suggested to rely more on staff experience who have international experience who would promote scientific research, active reaching and assessment methods and curriculum development based on their own examples. Of course, university wide general framework should support these developments as well.

2.3.4 Recommendations

- 1. It would be advised to have a common training for the whole staff about curriculum development, writing learning outcomes and new approaches to assessment methods. Currently these areas are a bit lacking behind general standards.*
- 2. Even if the UKZ is positioning itself as a "teaching university" it is still advised to have more focus on research outcome, especially in international peer reviewed journals. Even if the committee acknowledges that by now there are much more important priorities to focus on, this aim should be kept in mind for the future developments.*
- 3. In order to increase the international touch of the curriculum, it is suggested to offer more English language. At least one full course could be delivered fully in English. From time to time foreign guest speakers within the regular courses could offer additional value.*
- 4. The school should consider decreasing the number of incoming students in order to improve the students – teacher ratio and teaching quality. Also the system of maximum length of the students' status and maximum number of possibilities to take exams should heavily reconsidered on appropriate level of decision making system.*
- 5. While developing the curriculum further more attention should be paid on the titles of the courses, on the comprehensive list of all the courses and on "soft management*

subjects". The programme could focus more on communication, psychology, social transferable skills throughout the curriculum.

- 6. The teachers could consider including guest speakers/ social partners in their regular courses. Also internship options / the value of the internships could be promoted among the students.*
- 7. All additional exchange possibilities both among the staff and the students would offer a great value for the future.*
- 8. Last but for sure not least, more resources and administrative support should be given to the leaders of the programme who have vision and abilities to bring the programme to the next level of academic quality..*

Summary: Based on the argumentation beforehand the BSc programme in Management is well enough prepared and delivered. Some aspects need to get more attention/more focus in the future, but in general the curriculum has a strong leading team and it is delivering what it is promising. Therefore it is recommended to accredit the programme.

Tartu, 5th of June 2016

2.4 Computer Sciences (BSc 180 ECTS)

(DI Dr. Bratengeyer)

The “Computer Sciences, BSc” study programme has been submitted for re-accreditation after its first year of operation. Commendably, all the recommendations of the first evaluation report have been addressed in a diligent way, most of them have been put into practice.

The much elaborated SER and specifically the hand out provided by FCS staff were very helpful. The SER, however, does not contain proper descriptions of learning outcomes. Learning outcomes must be explicitly stated in terms of what students can do (has achieved), which must not be confused with terms from the planning point of view of the faculty (is intended). Formulating learning outcomes should not just be seen as expendable academic exercise. Moreover, proper learning outcomes can serve as metrics for designing exams and for evaluation of the curriculum.

The SER includes well drafted guiding principles regarding to quality assurance and related fields and continuously monitoring the quality of teaching and learning was announced. For specifically addressing quality issues concerning the development of e-learning (blended learning) applying the web-based self-evaluation tool at <http://en.elqe.at> might be helpful.

2.4.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The “Computer Sciences, BSc” study programme is conceived as a three-year full time bachelor programme. The “science” degree awarded (BSc) properly reflects the orientation of the programme. The allocation of 180 ECTS is according to international standards.

The well-structured curriculum contains typical subjects of a general computer science programme and the academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree. An interesting distinctive feature of the programme is the subject on Artificial Intelligence. The programme also contains elective subjects and, moreover, in the third year two different specialisations - Software Engineering & Web Design and Informatics in Economy - are offered. Both fields of study seem to properly reflect current market needs.

Course contents and objectives are presented in a clear manner and relevant literature is listed. In almost any technical domain and particularly in computer science English language plays a predominant role. Teaching, learning and research at an academic level in the IT-domain is very much depending on English literature which was taken into account properly. The poorly equipped library doesn't seem do affect the faculty because usage of web-based resources seems to be well-established. The meeting with students revealed that most of them spoke English pretty well. Yet, given the importance of English language in the domain of computer sciences there is still room for improvement for both, students and teaching staff. Some teaching staff is fluent in English and could offer training to their colleagues. Offering subjects in English could stimulate improving English language skills.

A new university which strives for excelling traditional competitors needs to walk the talk. Effectively, this can be achieved by applying contemporary teaching methods and providing students with the conveniences of e-learning. Students complained that e-learning was not supported in a comprehensive way. E-learning (or better to say blended learning) should be implemented unhesitatingly. First steps have been taken successfully by implementing a Moodle (certainly a good choice) test server. Running a “Computer Sciences” programme is offering best conditions to implement the required hard- and software and to provide the essential skills and competencies. Introducing e-learning requires proper planning, i.e. by developing an e-learning concept which has to address didactical, organizational, technological, and economical aspects. Training lecturers has to be paid particular attention to. The most promising way to start the implementation process is by organizing a workshop with all the relevant stakeholders (management, teaching staff, IT).

2.4.2 Research and Internationalization

Research activities still seem to be limited. Yet, development of e-learning allows for a plethora of research activities. Applied research in this field can yield many benefits, ranging from drafting theoretical concepts, drafting a dedicated FCS e-learning implementation policy, or practically implementing hard- and software like a learning management system or communication tools. This field of research can include both target groups, staff and students. Students can contribute to develop the field of e-learning by writing appropriate diploma thesis.

Admittedly, the sustainable development of e-learning can be a challenge. Thus learning from leading researchers is advisable. “The SAGE Handbook of E-learning Research” (2nd edition, edited by Caroline Haythornthwaite, Sage Publications Ltd., 2016), focusing on technology, theory, practice, pedagogy, and methods of analysis can make a valuable contribution to the faculty’s research ambitions.

Online access to scientific and scholarly information is provided in a free and unrestricted way by the Open Access (OA) initiative. OA repositories should be made accessible to teachers and students.

2.4.3 Staff

As of January 2016 three full-time professors and two lecturers have been employed at FCS additionally, which adds up to 5 professors, 2 lecturers and 2 teaching assistants. Given the number of current students (171) the teacher-to-students ratio is quite appropriate. Nonetheless, it was mentioned that staff at UKZ has to deal with overload. Regulations on quality assurance have been elaborated but can hardly be put into practice. Stable permanent staff committed to lecturing, research and administrative duties is most important for successful sustainable development of the faculty and of the university. At the current stage striving for quality assurance and stability should be prioritized over expansion.

In this light, the planned intake of students as high as 150 is not advisable. It is advised to considerably reduce that planned number. Instead of two cohorts à 75 one cohort seems more than enough. The current facilities (labs) would not allow for more, which is also according to the student's appraisal.

In order to provide e-learning which is to be based on a dedicated Learning Management Server it requires engaging a person in charge for the administration of the server. The required competences should include methods of managing users and activities to increase the effectiveness and efficiency of courses.

2.4.4 Recommendations

- 1. It is recommended to re-write the learning outcomes of the study programme not confusing intended objectives with achieved outcomes.*
- 2. It is recommended to draft a strategy for implementing e-learning (blended learning) and to implement a learning management server (LMS). In a second step the LMS should also be made available to all faculties.*
- 3. It is recommended to initiate research projects dealing with e-learning in order to promote the faculty's ambitions in that domain.*
- 4. It is recommended to increase the English language skills for both staff and students by offering trainings and by delivering lectures in English (including foreign guest speakers).*
- 5. It is recommended to put the well-elaborated quality guidelines into practice.*
- 6. It is recommended to limit the number of planned study places. The students intake planned for 2016/2017 should not exceed 75 (instead of 2 x 75).*

With these recommendations the accreditation of the "Computer Sciences, BSc" study programme is proposed.

Krems, 5th of June 2016